

#### NOTICE TO DEFEND

#### **NOTICE**

You have been sued in court. If you wish to defend against the claims set forth in the following pages, you must take action within twenty (20) days after this complaint and notice are served, by entering a written appearance personally or by attorney and filing in writing with the court your defenses or objections to the claims set forth against you. You are warned that if you fail to do so the case may proceed without you and a judgment may be entered against you by the court without further notice for any money claimed in the complaint of for any other claim or relief requested by the plaintiff. You may lose money or property or other rights important to you.

You should take this paper to your lawyer at once. If you do not have a lawyer or cannot afford one, go to or telephone the office set forth below to find out where you can get legal help.

Philadelphia Bar Association Lawyer Referral and Information Service One Reading Center Philadelphia, Pennsylvania 19107 (215) 238-6333 TTY (215) 451-6197

#### AVISO

Le han demandado a usted en la corte. Si usted quiere defenderse de estas demandas expuestas en las paginas siguientes, usted tiene veinte (20) dias de plazo al partir de la fecha de la demanda y la notificacion. Hace falta ascentar una comparencia escrita o en persona o con un abogado y entregar a la corte en forma escrita sus defensas o sus objeciones a las demandas en contra de su persona. Sea avisado que si usted no se defiende, la corte tomara medidas y puede continuar la demanda en contra suya sin previo aviso o notificacion. Ademas, la corte puede decider a favor del demandante y requiere que usted cumpla con todas las provisiones de esta demanda. Usted puede perder dinero o sus propiedades u otros derechos importantes para usted.

Lleve esta demanda a un abogado immediatamente. Si no tiene abogado o si no tiene el dinero suficiente de pagar tal servicio. Vaya en persona o llame por telefono a la oficina cuya direccion se encuentra escrita abajo para averiguar donde se puede conseguir asistencia legal.

Asociacion De Licenciados De Filadelfia Servicio De Referencia E Informacion Legal One Reading Center Filadelfia, Pennsylvania 19107 (215) 238-6333 TTY (215) 451-6197

32/4: 6 Case ID: 241200104

### IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA CIVIL TRIAL DIVISION

Paula Knudsen Burke (No. 87607) REPORTERS COMMITTEE FOR FREEDOM OF THE PRESS PO Box 1328 Lancaster, PA 17608	TERM, 2024
(717) 370-6884	1ERVI, 2021
pknudsen@rcfp.org	
THE DAILY PENNSYLVANIAN, 4015 Walnut St. Philadelphia, PA 19104 president@thedp.com	No
Plaintiff,	
v.	
CITY OF PHILADELPHIA,	
400 N. Broad St.	
Philadelphia, PA 19103 police.public.affairs@phila.gov	
Defendant.	

## **COMPLAINT IN MANDAMUS**

**AND NOW,** comes *The Daily Pennsylvanian*, Plaintiff, by its attorney, and files the following Complaint in Mandamus against the City of Philadelphia, representing in support thereof the following:

#### **PARTIES**

1. Plaintiff, *The Daily Pennsylvanian*, is the University of Pennsylvania's independent student media organization. Plaintiff covers news about the University of Pennsylvania and the

Philadelphia metropolitan area. Plaintiff's offices are located in Philadelphia at 4015 Walnut Street.

2. Defendant, the City of Philadelphia, is a political subdivision of the Commonwealth of Pennsylvania and manages, directs, and controls the Philadelphia Police Department ("PPD"). PPD is located at 400 N. Broad Street.

#### JURISDICTION AND VENUE

- 3. This Court has jurisdiction over this matter pursuant to 42 Pa.C.S.A. § 931.
- 4. Venue is proper in this Court pursuant to Pa. R. C. P. 2103(b) and 1091 et seq.

#### FACTUAL BACKGROUND

- 5. Like many other college campuses across the country, the University of Pennsylvania campus has experienced student protests and demonstrations about global issues, including the current conflict between Israel and Hamas. *The Daily Pennsylvanian* has provided ongoing news coverage of such events. *See*, *e.g.*, Ben Binday, *Inside Josh Shapiro's covert push for influence at Penn*, The Daily Pennsylvanian (November 21, 2024), available at https://www.thedp.com/article/2024/11/penn-shapiro-encampment-parker-gaza-solidarity-police.
- 6. As part of its continuing coverage, on October 22, 2024, *The Daily Pennsylvanian* published an article reporting complaints by student pro-Palestinian activists that their off-campus house had been searched by law enforcement officers on October 18, 2024. *See* Emily Scolnick, *Penn executes search warrant as pro-Palestinian activists allege 'raid' of student organizers' house*, The Daily Pennsylvanian (October 22, 2024), available at <a href="https://www.thedp.com/article/2024/10/penn-police-off-campus-raid">https://www.thedp.com/article/2024/10/penn-police-off-campus-raid</a>.
- 7. The University of Pennsylvania Division of Public Safety confirmed to *The Daily Pennsylvanian* that police officers executed a search warrant (the "Warrant") on October 18, 2024

at an off-campus location on that day. *Id.* According to an October 21, 2024 email from a University Division of Public Safety spokesperson to *The Daily Pennsylvanian*, "[t]he search warrant was reviewed by the District Attorney's Office and approved by a bail commissioner." *See* Oct. 21, 2024 Email attached hereto and incorporated herein as Ex. A.

- 8. Upon information and belief, the Warrant was executed by officers with the University of Pennsylvania Police Department ("UPPD") and PPD on October 18, 2024.
- 9. In accordance with Pa. R. Crim. P. 209(A), "[t]he law enforcement officer executing the search warrant shall return the search warrant promptly after the search is completed, along with any inventory required under paragraph (C), to the issuing authority." (Emphasis added). However, after significant due diligence, The Daily Pennsylvanian has confirmed that six weeks after the search the Warrant has not been returned to this Court as required by law.
- 10. Indeed, since learning of the execution of the Warrant, reporters from *The Daily Pennsylvanian* have been reporting on the matter and actively seeking a copy of the Warrant, without success. *See* Declaration of *The Daily Pennsylvanian* reporter and editor Jasmine Ni, attached hereto and incorporated herein as Ex. B.
- 11. On October 22, 2024, *The Daily Pennsylvanian* editor Benjamin Binday submitted two Right-to-Know Law requests—one to the Philadelphia Law Department and one to the PPD—each requesting "a copy of a search warrant which was executed by the PPD, in conjunction with Penn Police, on the morning of Friday 10/18." *See* Binday Right-to-Know Law Requests, attached hereto and incorporated herein as Ex. C.
- 12. On October 24, 2024, *The Daily Pennsylvanian* reporter and editor Jasmine Ni visited the Philadelphia Criminal Court Office of Judicial Records and was informed that the Warrant had not been filed. *See* Ex. B.

3

- 13. Ms. Ni followed up by phone with the Philadelphia Criminal Court Office of Judicial Records on October 28, October 29, November 11, and November 18, 2024, and was given the same information—that the Warrant had not yet been filed. *See* Ex. B.
- 14. On November 19, 2024, Ms. Ni visited the Southwest Division of PPD at 5510 Pine Street where Lt. Jennifer Branch told Ms. Ni that it was the responsibility of the UPPD to file the Warrant at the Philadelphia Criminal Court Office of Judicial Records and that PPD only had a copy of the Warrant for storage purposes. *See* Ex. B.
- 15. UPPD informed *The Daily Pennsylvanian's* reporters—via an inquiry from an attorney for the Pennsylvania NewsMedia Association, of which *The Daily Pennsylvanian* is a member—that it is the PPD which bears the responsibility of filing the Warrant with the court system. *See* November 13, 2024 email from Kathleen Shields Anderson to Melissa Melewsky, attached hereto and incorporated herein as Ex. D.
- 16. On November 27, 2024, *The Daily Pennsylvanian* editor Benjamin Binday received a reply, attached hereto an incorporated herein as Ex. E, to his October 22, 2024 Right-to-Know requests from Mr. Shea Skinner, Deputy City Solicitor/Right to Know, City of Philadelphia Law Department. Mr. Skinner denied Mr. Binday's requests and wrote, *inter alia*, that "judicially-approved search warrants are considered records of the judiciary, which are not accessible through Right to Know requests to the City." Ex. E.

#### **GROUNDS FOR MANDAMUS**

- 17. To date, Plaintiff has been unable to obtain the Warrant from the court system.
- 18. Plaintiff has no adequate remedy at law to obtain the Warrant in the manner provided by Pa .R. Crim. P. 209(A).

4

- 19. Plaintiff has been deprived of access to the Warrant, which is required to be filed with the court "promptly" after execution pursuant to Pa. R. Crim. P. 209(A).
- 20. An action in Mandamus is available to compel a tribunal, agency or public official to act when that tribunal, agency, or public official has been "sitting on its hands." *Pa Dental Ass'n v Insurance Department*, 512 Pa. 217, 228, 516 A.2d 647, 652 (1986). Plaintiff has established a clear legal right to relief and a corresponding mandatory, non-discretionary duty in the PPD to deposit the Warrant as required by the PaR.Crim.P. 209(A). PPD has failed to comply with its obligation to deposit the Warrant, necessitating Court intervention.

#### **CONCLUSION**

WHEREFORE, *The Daily Pennsylvanian* respectfully requests that this Court issue a Writ of Mandamus:

- a) Ordering Defendant to deposit the Warrant with the Philadelphia Criminal Court

  Office of Judicial Records within five (5) days of the date of this Order, providing

  Plaintiffs with a copy; and
- b) Directing such other relief as the Court may deem appropriate.

5

Dated: November 27, 2024

Respectfully Submitted,

Faula X Bulle.

pknudsen@rcfp.org

Paula Knudsen Burke (No. 87607)

REPORTERS COMMITTEE
FOR FREEDOM OF THE PRESS
Lancaster, PA 17608
PO Box 1328
(717) 370-6884

### **VERIFICATION**

I, Jared Mitovich, Editor-in-Chief of *The Daily Pennsylvanian*, hereby state that the facts above set forth in the Complaint in Mandamus are true and correct to the best of my knowledge, information and belief and I expect to be able to prove the same at a hearing held in this matter. I understand that the statements herein are made subject to the penalties of 18 Pa.C.S. §4904 (relating to unsworn falsification to authorities).

(signature)

Date: Nov. 27, 2024

Jared Mitovich

## **CERTIFICATE OF COMPLIANCE WITH PUBLIC ACCESS POLICY**

I certify that this filing complies with the provisions of the *Case Records Public Access*Policy of the Unified Judicial System of Pennsylvania that require filing confidential information and documents differently than non-confidential information and documents.

Date: November 27, 2024

Submitted by: Paula Knudsen Burke

Signature: \_\_\_\_/s/Paula Knudsen Burke\_\_\_\_\_ Attorney No.: 87607

8

# **EXHIBIT A**

From: Ritchey, Stacy < <a href="mailto:sritchey@publicsafety.upenn.edu">sritchey@publicsafety.upenn.edu</a>>

Date: Mon, Oct 21, 2024 at 10:39 PM

Subject: Re: [EXTERNAL] DP Inquiry - Penn Police house raid, 10/18 6 a.m.

To: Emily Scolnick < scolnick@dailypennsylvanian.com >

Cc: Greenberg, Nora Nienhagen < ngreenberg@publicsafety.upenn.edu >

Hi Emily,

Hope you are having a good night as well.

Please see a statement from the Division of Public Safety below.

While we do not comment on open criminal investigations, we can confirm that on Friday, Penn Police did execute a search warrant at an off-campus location. The search warrant was reviewed by the District Attorney's Office and approved by a bail commissioner. This search warrant was executed following all proper policies and procedures.

-Public Safety

#### **Stacy Lutner Ritchey**

Director of Communications
Office of the Vice President

University of Pennsylvania Division of Public Safety 4040 Chestnut Street Philadelphia, PA 19104

P: 215-746-3811

E: <a href="mailto:sritchey@publicsafety.upenn.edu">sritchey@publicsafety.upenn.edu</a>
W: <a href="mailto:www.publicsafety.upenn.edu">www.publicsafety.upenn.edu</a>

#### **Emergencies:**

PennComm Center 215-573-3333 Or 511 from any campus phone

To learn how to become Green Office Certified, click <u>here</u>.

## **EXHIBIT B**

### IN THE COURT OF COMMON PLEAS OF PHILADELPHIA COUNTY FIRST JUDICIAL DISTRICT OF PENNSYLVANIA CIVIL TRIAL DIVISION

THE DAILY PENNSYLVANIAN,  Plaintiff,	
v.	No.
CITY OF PHILADELPHIA, <i>Defendant</i> .	

#### **DECLARATION OF JASMINE NI**

- I, Jasmine Ni, declare as follows:
- 1. I am currently a General Assignments Editor and Politics Beat Reporter at *The Daily Pennsylvanian*, the independent student newspaper for the University of Pennsylvania.
- 2. As a General Assignments Editor and Politics Beat Reporter at the Daily Pennsylvanian, I cover campus and off-campus topics, including activities of law enforcement.
- 3. I have personal knowledge of the matters described in this declaration.
- 4. According to a statement issued to *The Daily Pennsylvanian* by the University of Pennsylvania Division of Public Safety on October 21, 2024, the University of Pennsylvania Police Department ("UPPD") and Philadelphia Police Department ("PPD") officers executed a search warrant (the "Warrant") on October 18, 2024 at an off-campus location.
- 5. On October 24, 2024, accompanied by fellow *The Daily Pennsylvanian* reporter Ethan Young, I visited the Philadelphia Criminal Court Office of Judicial Records, where an employee at front desk informed me that the Warrant had not yet been filed. On that same day, Mr. Young and I also visited the Philadelphia District Attorney's Office, where it was

1

- recommended that I contact PPD's Records Control Department to inquire about the Warrant.
- 6. I called the PPD Records Control Department and provided the operator with a list of names 
  The Daily Pennsylvanian considered plausible subjects of the search warrant, and the 
  operator looked up the name in their system with no affirmative results. I called the PPD 
  Records Control Department back later that same day to provide more names and was told by 
  the same operator that she had been chastised by her supervisor for looking up names in their 
  system for me and could not help me any further.
- 7. I called the Philadelphia Criminal Court Office of Judicial Records on October 28, October 29, November 11, and November 18, 2024 to ask about obtaining a copy of the Warrant and was informed again on all of those occasions that the Warrant had not yet been filed.
- 8. On November 19, 2024, I visited the Southwest Detectives Division of the Philadelphia Police Department ("PPD") at 5510 Pine St, Philadelphia, PA 19143. I identified myself as a reporter with *The Daily Pennsylvanian* and explained that I had questions about the Warrant. I was directed by the individual at the front desk at the Southwest Detectives Division office to speak with Lt. Jennifer Branch. I met Lt. Branch in the waiting area on the second floor, outside of the Southwest Detectives Division office. She told me that it was the responsibility of UPPD to file the Warrant at the Office of Judicial Records. Additionally, she told me that PPD only had a copy of the Warrant for storage purposes.
- 9. As of November 27, 2024, I have not examined or received a copy of the Warrant.
- 10. I declare under penalty of perjury that the foregoing is true and correct to the best of my knowledge.

2

Executed on November 27, 2024.

Jus m

Jasmine Ni Philadelphia, PA

# **EXHIBIT C**



## Standard Right-to-Know Law Request Form

Please read carefully. Complete this form and retain a copy of **both** pages; this copy may be required if an appeal is filed. You have 15 business days to appeal after a request is denied or deemed denied. More information about the RTKL is available at <a href="https://www.openrecords.pa.gov">https://www.openrecords.pa.gov</a>. In most cases, a completed RTKL request form is a public record.

SUBMITTED TO AGENCY NAME	፭:		(Attn: AORO)
Date Request Submitted:		Submit	ted via: □ Email □ U.S. Mail □ Fax □ In Person
PERSON MAKING REQUEST:			
Full Name:			
Company (if applicable):			
Please send response via: □ F	Email □ U.S.	Mail	
If you wish to obtain records tha you may be required to provide a			must be provided on an electronic storage device, ncy. See Section 703.
Email:			
Mailing Address:			
City:	State:	Zip:	Telephone:
How do you prefer to be cont	acted if the	agency has q	uestions? □ Telephone □ Email □ U.S. Mail
and that I am a legal reside	nt of the Ui	nited States.	nd contact information is true and correct, <u>I understand that failure to check this box</u> nissal of any appeal filed with the Office of
<b>RECORDS REQUESTED:</b> Provide	e as much de	tail as possible	e, including subject matter, time frame, and type of

Form continues on page 2. Retain a copy of both pages.

record sought. RTKL requests must seek records, not ask questions. Use additional pages if necessary.

RECORDS REQUESTED (continued):
<b>DO YOU WANT COPIES?</b> □ Yes, printed □ Yes, electronic □ No, in-person inspection
Records shall be provided in the medium requested if they exist in that medium; otherwise, they shall be provided in the medium in which they exist. See Section 701. Your request may require payment or prepayment of fees. View the Official RTKL Fee Schedule for more details.
I understand that my request may incur fees. Notify me before further processing if fees will be more than $\Box$ \$100 (or) $\Box$ \$
Do you want certified copies? $\square$ Yes (may be subject to additional costs) $\square$ No
ITEMS BELOW THIS LINE FOR AGENCY USE ONLY
Tracking: Date Received: Response Due (5 bus. days):
30-Day Ext.? ☐ Yes ☐ No (If Yes, Final Due Date:) Actual Response Date:
Request was: $\square$ Granted $\square$ Partially Granted & Denied $\square$ Denied Cost to Requester:
$\square$ Appropriate third parties notified and given an opportunity to object to the release of requested records.

Retain a copy of <u>both</u> pages of this Form.

2 of 2 Case ID: 241200104



## Standard Right-to-Know Law Request Form

Please read carefully. Complete this form and retain a copy of **both** pages; this copy may be required if an appeal is filed. You have 15 business days to appeal after a request is denied or deemed denied. More information about the RTKL is available at <a href="https://www.openrecords.pa.gov">https://www.openrecords.pa.gov</a>. In most cases, a completed RTKL request form is a public record.

SUBMITTED TO AGENCY NAME	፭:		(Attn: AORO)
Date Request Submitted:		Submit	ted via: □ Email □ U.S. Mail □ Fax □ In Person
PERSON MAKING REQUEST:			
Full Name:			
Company (if applicable):			
Please send response via: □ F	Email □ U.S.	Mail	
If you wish to obtain records tha you may be required to provide a			must be provided on an electronic storage device, ncy. See Section 703.
Email:			
Mailing Address:			
City:	State:	Zip:	Telephone:
How do you prefer to be cont	acted if the	agency has q	uestions? □ Telephone □ Email □ U.S. Mail
and that I am a legal reside	nt of the Ui	nited States.	nd contact information is true and correct, <u>I understand that failure to check this box</u> nissal of any appeal filed with the Office of
<b>RECORDS REQUESTED:</b> Provide	e as much de	tail as possible	e, including subject matter, time frame, and type of

Form continues on page 2. Retain a copy of both pages.

record sought. RTKL requests must seek records, not ask questions. Use additional pages if necessary.

RECORDS REQUESTED (continued):
<b>DO YOU WANT COPIES?</b> □ Yes, printed □ Yes, electronic □ No, in-person inspection
Records shall be provided in the medium requested if they exist in that medium; otherwise, they shall be provided in the medium in which they exist. See Section 701. Your request may require payment or prepayment of fees. View the Official RTKL Fee Schedule for more details.
I understand that my request may incur fees. Notify me before further processing if fees will be more than $\Box$ \$100 (or) $\Box$ \$
Do you want certified copies? $\square$ Yes (may be subject to additional costs) $\square$ No
ITEMS BELOW THIS LINE FOR AGENCY USE ONLY
Tracking: Date Received: Response Due (5 bus. days):
30-Day Ext.? ☐ Yes ☐ No (If Yes, Final Due Date:) Actual Response Date:
Request was: $\square$ Granted $\square$ Partially Granted & Denied $\square$ Denied Cost to Requester:
$\square$ Appropriate third parties notified and given an opportunity to object to the release of requested records.

Retain a copy of <u>both</u> pages of this Form.

2 of 2 Case ID: 241200104

## **EXHIBIT D**



## RE: [EXTERNAL] The Daily Pennsylvanian

1 message

Kathleen Shields Anderson <vp@publicsafety.upenn.edu>
To: "melissam@pa-news.org" <melissam@pa-news.org>
Cc: "pknudsen@rcfp.org" <pknudsen@rcfp.org>

Wed, Nov 13, 2024 at 9:33 AM

Dear Ms. Melewsky,

Thank you for your inquiry regarding this matter. The University of Pennsylvania Police Department (UPPD) is a private department and is not subject to Pennsylvania's Right-to-Know Law. Following the execution of a search warrant by the UPPD and in accordance with our agreement with the City, the Philadelphia Police Department (PPD) retains a copy of the warrant and subsequently transmits it to the First Judicial District of Pennsylvania following the PPD's standard procedures. The UPPD followed this protocol and provided the PPD with a copy of the executed warrant in this matter.

Sincerely,

#### Kathleen Shields Anderson, JD, MBA

Vice President

University of Pennsylvania

Division of Public Safety

4040 Chestnut Street

Philadelphia, PA 19104

Phone: <u>215-898-7515</u>

Web: www.publicsafety.upenn.edu

From: Melissa Melewsky <melissam@pa-news.org>
Sent: Wednesday, November 6, 2024 9:49:06 AM

To: Anderson, Kathleen Shields <kanderson@publicsafety.upenn.edu>

**Cc:** Paula Knudsen Burke <pknudsen@rcfp.org> **Subject:** [EXTERNAL] The Daily Pennsylvanian

**Caution:** [EXTERNAL E-MAIL] This e-mail originated outside of our organization. Please do not click links or open attachments unless you are certain you recognize the sender and know the content is safe.

I am an attorney with the Pennsylvania NewsMedia Association (PNA), and I'm reaching out on behalf of The Daily Pennsylvanian, a member of PNA in good standing. The student journalists have made multiple attempts to secure access to a search warrant that was executed by campus police at an off-campus location on October 18. The campus police confirmed the warrant was executed, and as such, it is a public record. The student journalists have sought access from campus police, the District Attorney, and the court system with no success because there is apparently no record of the warrant being returned to the court by campus police after execution as required by law.

I would like to set up a time to discuss this issue with you as soon as possible, and I have time to chat throughout the week. Please let me know what works for your schedule.

Thank you, Melissa

**Melissa Bevan Melewsky** | Media Law Counsel | Pennsylvania NewsMedia Association | 717.703.3048 (office) 717.903.4782 (cell)

The information contained in this email message is intended only for the personal and confidential use of the intended recipient. If the reader of this message is not the intended recipient or an agent responsible for delivering it to the intended recipient, you are hereby notified that you have received this document in error and that any review, dissemination, distribution, or copying of this message is strictly prohibited. If you have received this communication in error, please notify us immediately by email, and delete the original message.

## **EXHIBIT E**

### **CITY OF PHILADELPHIA**



LAW DEPARTMENT

ONE PARKWAY BUILDING 1515 ARCH STREET PHILADELPHIA. PA 19102

Renee Garcia City Solicitor

Shea Skinner Deputy City Solicitor

November 27, 2024

### **VIA EMAIL**

Benjamin Binday
The Daily Pennsylvanian
binday@dailypennsylvanian.com

Re: Search warrant executed on 10/18/24 near Penn's campus

Requests #: 29895 and 29900

Dear Benjamin Binday:

Thank you for writing to the City of Philadelphia ("City") with your request for information pursuant to the Pennsylvania Right-To-Know Law (RTKL), 65 P.S. § 67.101 et seq. On October 22, 2024, the City received your requests seeking:

[Request #29895, directed to the Law Department]

I am requesting a copy of a search warrant which was executed by police officers on the morning of 10/18 around 6 a.m. in West Philadelphia, near Penn's campus. The warrant was approved by the DAO and a bail commissioner on 10/16. The search warrant was likely approved on suspicion of vandalism, and may be for a residence in the vicinity of 40th Street and Baltimore Avenue.

[Request #29895, directed to the Philadelphia Police Department]

I am requesting a copy of a search warrant which was executed by the PPD, in conjunction with Penn Police, on the morning of Friday 10/18. The search warrant was executed in the vicinity of Penn's campus in University City, likely in the area of 40th Street and Baltimore Avenue.

By correspondence dated October 29, 2024, the City acknowledged receipt of your requests invoked a thirty calendar-day extension of time in which to respond. This correspondence constitutes the City's final response to your requests.

Your request is <u>denied</u>. Initially, to the extent your request seeks a record relating to an investigation conducted by the University of Pennsylvania Police Department, which is not an agency of the City of Philadelphia, your request is misdirected.

Additionally, judicially-approved search warrants are considered records of the judiciary, which are not accessible through Right to Know requests to the City. See, e.g., Bender-Mathis v. Erie County District Attorney's Office, AP 2024-0187, 2024 WL 244474 (Pa.Off.Open Rec.) (search warrants authorized by a judge are judicial records and criminal investigative records which the OOR lacks jurisdiction over); Cuevas Heredia v. Pa. State Police, AP 2024-0323, 2024 WL 943229 (Pa.Off.Open Rec.) (noting that "Search warrants are judicial records, over which the OOR has no jurisdiction."); Phila. Dist. Attorney's Off. v. Stover, 176 A.3d 1024 (Pa. Commw. Ct. 2017). However, judicial records can be requested from judicial records custodians pursuant to the Unified Judicial System's Public Access Policy. See <a href="http://www.pacourts.us/public-records/public-records-policies">http://www.pacourts.us/public-records/public-records-policies</a>.

Further, records "relating to or resulting in a criminal investigation" are exempt from disclosure pursuant to 65 P.S. § 67.708(b)(16), explicitly including, but not limited to, "[i]nvestigative materials, notes, correspondence, videos and reports" and records that, if disclosed, would "[r]eveal the institution, progress or result of a criminal investigation." 65 P.S. § 67.708(b)(16)(ii), (vi)(A).

Similarly, "investigative information" is protected from public disclosure pursuant to the Criminal History Record Information Act ("CHRIA"). 18 Pa.C.S. §§ 9101 et seq. CHRIA defines investigative information as "[i]nformation assembled as a result of the performance of any inquiry, formal or informal, into a criminal incident or an allegation of criminal wrongdoing." 18 Pa.C.S. § 9102. Thus, records "assembled as a result of" an inquiry into allegations of criminal conduct considered to be investigative information under CHRIA. Disclosure of investigative and treatment information is not permitted to any "department, agency, or individual unless the department, agency, or individual [. . .] is a criminal justice agency which requests the information in connection with its duties." 18 Pa.C.S. § 9106(c)(4); see also 18 Pa.C.S. § 9121(d).

**Appeals processing:** If you wish to appeal this denial pursuant to 65 P.S. § 67.708(b)(16) regarding records relating to a criminal investigation, you may file an appeal with the Philadelphia District Attorney's Office as set forth in 65 P.S. § 67.1101 and 65 P.S. § 503(d)(2). Please direct any appeal to the DA RTKL Appeals Officer, Three South Penn Square, Philadelphia, PA 19107-3499 and copy the undersigned.

If you wish to appeal this determination, you must do so within 15 business days of the date of this correspondence.

See the following link for additional resources regarding the RTKL, public information available online, and other record request processes: <a href="https://linktr.ee/phillylaw">https://linktr.ee/phillylaw</a>

This correspondence will close your request with our office as permitted by law.

Respectfully,

**Shea Skinner** (he/him)

Muffer

Deputy City Solicitor – Right to Know City of Philadelphia Law Department